# BILEVEL TRANSPORTATION PROBLEMS 

## DOREL I. DUCA and LIANA LUPŞA

Dedicated to the memory of Acad. Tiberiu Popoviciu


#### Abstract

In this paper we formulate the bilevel transportation problem of the cost-time type and of the cost-cost type, we propose a general algorithm for solving this problems and we also give two examples.


MSC 2000. 90C08, 90C29.
Keywords. transportation problem, bilevel programming problem.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The bilevel (or two level) mathematical programming problem is an optimization problem with special constraints determined by, all or in part, another optimization problem. The bilevel mathematical programming problem is defined conventionally as follows:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Find } x^{*} \in \mathbb{R}^{n} \text { such that } x^{*} \text { solves } \\
& \min F(x, y(x)) \\
& \text { subject to } G(x, y(x)) \leq 0,
\end{aligned}
$$

where $y(x)$ solves, for fixed $x$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min f(x, y) \\
& \text { subject to } g(x, y) \leq 0,
\end{aligned}
$$

where $G: \mathbb{R}^{q} \times \mathbb{R}^{p} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{r}, F: \mathbb{R}^{q} \times \mathbb{R}^{p} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}, g: \mathbb{R}^{q} \times \mathbb{R}^{p} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{s}$, and $f: \mathbb{R}^{q} \times \mathbb{R}^{p} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, are functions.

[^0]
## 2. BILEVEL TRANSPORTATION PROBLEM OF THE COST-TIME TYPE

Let $a_{1}, \ldots, a_{m}, b_{1}, \ldots, b_{n}$ be positive integers so that $a_{1}+\ldots+a_{m}=$ $b_{1}+\ldots+b_{n}$. Let $M=\{1, \ldots, m\}, P=\{1, \ldots, p\}, S=\{p+1, \ldots, n\}$,

$$
\Lambda=\left\{X=\left[x_{i j}\right] \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times p} \mid \sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \forall j \in P \text { and } \sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \forall i \in M\right\}
$$

If $X \in \Lambda$, then we put

$$
\begin{array}{r}
U(X)=\left\{Y(X) \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times(n-p)} \mid \sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}(X)=b_{j}, \forall j \in S\right. \\
\left.\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}(X)=a_{i}-\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}, \forall i \in M\right\}
\end{array}
$$

The bilevel transportation problem of the cost-time type is defined as follows:

Find $\quad X^{*} \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times p}$ such that $X^{*}$ solves
$\min \quad g(X)=\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in P} c_{i j} x_{i j}+\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in S} c_{i j} y_{i j}^{*}(X)$
subject

## to

$\sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in P$, $\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \quad i \in M$, $\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}+\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}^{*}(X)=a_{i}, \quad i \in M$ $x_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, j \in P$,
where $Y^{*}(X)=\left[y_{i j}^{*}(x)\right] \in U(X)$ solves, for fixed $X \in \Lambda$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min \max \left\{t_{i j} \cdot \operatorname{sgn} y_{i j}(X) \mid(i, j) \in\{1, \ldots, m\} \times\{p+1, \ldots, n\}\right\} \\
& \text { subject to } \\
& \quad \sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}=a_{i}-\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}, \quad i \in M \\
& \sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in S \\
& y_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, j \in S .
\end{aligned}
$$

In the following we denote by $C$ the matrix of costs and by $T$ the matrix of times:

$$
C=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
c_{11} & \ldots & c_{1 n} \\
\ldots & \ldots & \ldots \\
c_{m 1} & \ldots & c_{m n}
\end{array}\right) \quad \text { and } \quad T=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
t_{1, p+1} & \ldots & t_{1 n} \\
\ldots & \ldots & \ldots \\
t_{m, p+1} & \ldots & t_{m n}
\end{array}\right)
$$

If we denote by $\alpha_{i}=\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}, i \in M$, we have

$$
0 \leq \alpha_{i} \leq a_{i}, i \in M, \quad \text { and } \quad \sum_{i \in M} \alpha_{i}=\sum_{j \in S} b_{j}
$$

Let be

$$
H=\left\{\alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{m}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{m} \mid 0 \leq \alpha_{i} \leq a_{i}, \forall i \in M, \quad \sum_{i \in M} \alpha_{i}=\sum_{j \in S} b_{j}\right\}
$$

Let the parametric transportation problem of the time type be
(PTP)

$$
t^{*}(\alpha)=\min \max \left\{t_{i j} \cdot \operatorname{sgn} y_{i j}: i \in M, j \in S\right\}
$$

subject to

$$
\begin{gathered}
\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}=\alpha_{i}, \quad i \in M \\
\sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in S \\
y_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, \quad j \in S
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{m}\right) \in H$. If $\alpha^{0} \in H$, then by $\left(P T P\left(\alpha^{0}\right)\right)$ we denote the transportation problem of the time type which is obtained from (PTP) for $\alpha=\alpha^{0}$.

Solving the problem $(P T P)$, we obtain a split of the set $H$ into a finite number of subsets $H_{1}, \ldots, H_{q} \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{m}$, such that $H_{1} \cup \cdots \cup H_{q}=H$, and for each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$, there are a real number $T_{k}$, with the property

$$
t^{*}(\alpha)=T_{k} \text { for all } \alpha \in H_{k},
$$

and a matrix, which we denote by $Y^{k}(\alpha)$,

$$
Y^{k}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
y_{1, p+1}^{k}(\alpha) & \ldots & y_{1 n}^{k}(\alpha) \\
\ldots & \ldots & \\
y_{m, p+1}^{k}(\alpha) & \ldots & y_{m n}^{k}(\alpha)
\end{array}\right)
$$

such that $Y^{k}(\alpha)$ is an optimal solution for the problem $(P T P(\alpha))$ for each $\alpha \in H_{k}$. Then a solution of the problem $(P T P)$ is a function $h: H \rightarrow$ $\mathbb{N}^{m \times(n-p)}$, given by

$$
h(\alpha)=Y^{k}(\alpha), \quad \forall \alpha \in H_{k}
$$

for each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$.
For each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$, we solve the parametric transportation problem of the cost type

$$
\begin{equation*}
\min \left(F\left(X, Y^{k}(\alpha)\right)=\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in P} c_{i j} x_{i j}+\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in S} c_{i j} y_{i j}^{k}(\alpha)\right) \tag{k}
\end{equation*}
$$

subject to

$$
\begin{gathered}
\sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad \forall j \in P \\
\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \quad \forall i \in M \\
\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}+\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}^{k}(\alpha)=a_{i}, \quad \forall i \in M \\
x_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \forall i \in M, \forall j \in P
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\alpha \in H_{k}$.
For each $\alpha \in H_{k}$ we denote by $X^{k}(\alpha)$ an optimal solution of the problem $\left(T P_{k}(\alpha)\right)$, obtained from $\left(T P_{k}\right)$ when $\alpha$ is fixed.

Let $\alpha^{*} \in H_{k}$, such that

$$
F\left(X^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right), Y^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right)\right)=\min \left\{F\left(X^{k}(\alpha), Y^{k}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in H_{k}\right\}
$$

Then, we call the matrix $X^{k}=X^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right)$, the best solution of the problem $\left(T P_{k}\right)$.

The solution of the bilevel transportation problem (BTP) is that $X^{k}$ for which we have

$$
g\left(X^{k}\right)=\min \left\{g\left(X^{l}\right): l \in\{1, \ldots, q\}\right\}
$$

In order to illustrate the above algorithm we conclude with the following numerical example.
Example Let us consider the bilevel cost-time transportation problem which has: $m=3, p=3, n=4, a_{1}=80, a_{2}=25, a_{3}=45, b_{1}=75, b_{2}=$ $40, b_{3}=15, b_{4}=20$, the times matrix : $T=\left(\begin{array}{l}3 \\ 2 \\ 4\end{array}\right)$, and the costs matrix :

$$
C=\left(\begin{array}{llll}
3 & 2 & 5 & 1 \\
1 & 3 & 2 & 4 \\
5 & 2 & 4 & 3
\end{array}\right)
$$

The set $H$ is

$$
H=\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{3} \mid 0 \leq \alpha_{1} \leq 80,0 \leq \alpha_{2} \leq 25,0 \leq \alpha_{3} \leq 45, ~ 子, ~ \alpha_{1}+\alpha_{2}+\alpha_{3}=20\right\} .
$$

We have

$$
H=H_{1} \bigcup H_{2} \bigcup H_{3}
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
H_{1} & =\{(0,20,0)\} \\
H_{2} & =\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, 0\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{3} \mid 1 \leq \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}+\alpha_{2}=20\right\} \\
H_{3} & =\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{3} \mid \alpha_{3} \geq 1, \alpha_{1}+\alpha_{2}+\alpha_{3}=20\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
& Y^{1}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
0 \\
20 \\
2
\end{array}\right), \quad Y^{2}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
\alpha_{1} \\
\alpha_{2} \\
0
\end{array}\right), \quad Y^{3}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{l}
\alpha_{1} \\
\alpha_{2} \\
\alpha_{3}
\end{array}\right) \\
& X^{1}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
70 & 10 & 0 \\
5 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { for } \quad \alpha \in H_{1}, \\
& X^{2}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
70-\alpha_{1} & 10 & 0 \\
25-\alpha_{2} & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { for } \quad \alpha \in H_{2}, \\
& X^{3}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
70-\alpha_{1}-\alpha_{3} & \alpha_{3}+10 & 0 \\
5+\alpha_{1}+\alpha_{3} & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30-\alpha_{3} & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { for } \alpha \in H_{3}, \\
& \min \left\{F\left(X^{1}(\alpha), Y^{1}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in H_{1}\right\}=435=F\left(X^{1}(0,20,0), Y^{1}(0,20,0)\right), \\
& \min \left\{F\left(X^{2}(\alpha), Y^{2}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in H_{2}\right\}=335=F\left(X^{2}(20,0,0), Y^{2}(20,0,0)\right), \\
& \min \left\{F\left(X^{3}(\alpha), Y^{3}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in H_{3}\right\}=337=F\left(X^{3}(19,0,1), Y^{3}(19,0,1)\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Hence

$$
\begin{aligned}
& X^{1}=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
70 & 10 & 0 \\
5 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { and } \quad Y^{1}\left(X^{1}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
0 \\
20 \\
0
\end{array}\right) \\
& X^{2}=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
50 & 10 & 0 \\
25 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { and } Y^{2}\left(X^{2}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
20 \\
0 \\
0
\end{array}\right), \\
& X^{3}=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
50 & 11 & 0 \\
25 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 29 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { and } Y^{3}\left(X^{3}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
19 \\
0 \\
1
\end{array}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

It follows that

$$
\min \left\{g\left(X^{1}\right), g\left(X^{2}\right), g\left(X^{3}\right)\right\}=335=g\left(X^{2}\right)
$$

Hence the optimal solution for the bilevel transportation problem of the cost-time type is

$$
X^{*}=X^{2}=\left(\begin{array}{rrr}
50 & 10 & 0 \\
25 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 30 & 15
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { and } \quad Y^{*}\left(X^{*}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{r}
20 \\
0 \\
0
\end{array}\right)
$$

## 3. BILEVEL TRANSPORTATION PROBLEM OF THE COST-COST TYPE

Let $a_{1}, \ldots, a_{m}, b_{1}, \ldots, b_{n}$ be positive integers so that $a_{1}+\ldots+a_{m}=b_{1}+$ $\ldots+b_{n}$. Let $M=\{1, \ldots, m\}, P=\{1, \ldots, p\}, S=\{p+1, \ldots, n\}$,
$\Lambda=\left\{X \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times p} \mid \sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \forall j \in P \quad\right.$ and $\left.\quad \sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \forall i \in M\right\}$.
If $X \in \Lambda$, then we put

$$
\begin{array}{r}
U(X)=\left\{Y(X) \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times(n-p)} \mid \sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}(X)=b_{j}, \forall j \in S\right. \\
\left.\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}(X)=a_{i}-\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}, \forall i \in M\right\}
\end{array}
$$

The bilevel transportation problem of the cost-cost type is defined as follows:

Find $\quad X^{*} \in \mathbb{N}^{m \times p}$ such that $X^{*}$ solves
$\min \quad g(X)=\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in P} c_{i j} x_{i j}+\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in S} c_{i j} y_{i j}^{*}(X)$
subject to

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in P \\
& \sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \quad i \in M \\
& \sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}+\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}^{*}(X)=a_{i}, \quad i \in M \\
& x_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, j \in P
\end{aligned}
$$

where $Y^{*}(X) \in U(X)$ solves, for fixed $X \in \Lambda$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min \sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=p+1}^{n} d_{i j} y_{i j}(X) \\
& \text { subject to } \\
& \quad \sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}=a_{i}-\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}, \quad i \in M \\
& \sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in S \\
& y_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, j \in S
\end{aligned}
$$

In the following we denote by $C$ and $D$ the matrices of costs:

$$
C=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
c_{11} & \ldots & c_{1 n} \\
\ldots & \ldots & \ldots \\
c_{m 1} & \ldots & c_{m n}
\end{array}\right) \quad \text { and } \quad D=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
d_{1, p+1} & \ldots & d_{1 n} \\
\ldots & \ldots & \ldots \\
d_{m, p+1} & \ldots & d_{m n}
\end{array}\right)
$$

Let be

$$
H=\left\{\alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{m}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{m} \mid 0 \leq \alpha_{i} \leq a_{i}, \forall i \in M, \quad \sum_{i \in M} \alpha_{i}=\sum_{j \in S} b_{j}\right\}
$$

Let the parametric transportation problem of the cost type be
$(P C P)$

$$
g^{*}(\alpha)=\min \sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in S} d_{i j} y_{i j}
$$

subject to

$$
\begin{gathered}
\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}=\alpha_{i}, \quad i \in M \\
\sum_{i \in M} y_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad j \in S \\
y_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \quad i \in M, \quad j \in S
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{m}\right) \in H$. If $\alpha^{0} \in H$, then by $\left(P C P\left(\alpha^{0}\right)\right)$ we denote
the transportation problem of the cost type which is obtained from (PCP) for $\alpha=\alpha^{0}$.

Solving the problem $(P C P)$, we obtain a split of the set $H$ into a finite number of subsets $H_{1}, \ldots, H_{q} \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{m}$, such that $H_{1} \cup \cdots \cup H_{q}=H$, and for each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$, there are a real number $d_{k}$, with the property

$$
g^{*}(\alpha)=d_{k} \text { for all } \alpha \in H_{k},
$$

and a matrix, which we denote by $Y^{k}(\alpha)$,

$$
Y^{k}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
y_{1, p+1}^{k}(\alpha) & \ldots & y_{1 n}^{k}(\alpha) \\
\ldots & \ldots & \\
y_{m, p+1}^{k}(\alpha) & \ldots & y_{m n}^{k}(\alpha)
\end{array}\right)
$$

such that $Y^{k}(\alpha)$ is an optimal solution for the problem $(P C P(\alpha))$ for each $\alpha \in H_{k}$. Then a solution of the problem $(P C P)$ is a function $h: H \rightarrow$ $\mathbb{N}^{m \times(n-p)}$, given by

$$
h(\alpha)=Y^{k}(\alpha), \quad \forall \alpha \in H_{k},
$$

for each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$.
For each $k \in\{1, \ldots, q\}$, we solve the parametric transportation problem of the cost type
$\left(C P_{k}\right) \quad \min \left(F\left(X, Y^{k}(\alpha)\right)=\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in P} c_{i j} x_{i j}+\sum_{i \in M} \sum_{j \in S} c_{i j} y_{i j}^{k}(\alpha)\right)$
subject to

$$
\begin{gathered}
\sum_{i \in M} x_{i j}=b_{j}, \quad \forall j \in P \\
\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j} \leq a_{i}, \quad \forall i \in M \\
\sum_{j \in P} x_{i j}+\sum_{j \in S} y_{i j}^{k}(\alpha)=a_{i}, \quad \forall i \in M \\
x_{i j} \in \mathbb{N}, \forall i \in M, \forall j \in P,
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\alpha \in H_{k}$.
For each $\alpha \in H_{k}$ we denote by $X^{k}(\alpha)$ an optimal solution of the problem $\left(C P_{k}(\alpha)\right)$, obtained from $\left(C P_{k}\right)$ when $\alpha$ is fixed.
Let $\alpha^{*} \in H_{k}$, such that

$$
F\left(X^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right), Y^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right)\right)=\min \left\{F\left(X^{k}(\alpha), Y^{k}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in H_{k}\right\} .
$$

Then, we call the matrix $X^{k}=X^{k}\left(\alpha^{*}\right)$, the best solution of the problem $\left(C P_{k}\right)$.

The solution of the bilevel transportation problem (BCP) is that $X^{k}$ for which we have

$$
g\left(X^{k}\right)=\min \left\{g\left(X^{l}\right): l \in\{1, \ldots, q\}\right\} .
$$

In order to illustrate the above algorithm we conclude with the following numerical example.
Example Let us consider the bilevel cost-cost transportation problem which has: $m=2, p=2, n=4, a_{1}=80, a_{2}=70, b_{1}=20, b_{2}=10, b_{3}=$ $90, b_{4}=30$, the first costs matrix : $D=\left(\begin{array}{ll}2 & 3 \\ 1 & 2\end{array}\right)$, and the second costs matrix :

$$
C=\left(\begin{array}{llll}
3 & 2 & 5 & 3 \\
1 & 3 & 2 & 2
\end{array}\right)
$$

The set $H$ is

$$
H=\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{2} \mid 0 \leq \alpha_{1} \leq 80,0 \leq \alpha_{2} \leq 70, \alpha_{1}+\alpha_{2}=120\right\}
$$

It is easy to see that

$$
H=\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, 120-\alpha_{1}\right) \in \mathbb{N}^{2} \mid 50 \leq \alpha_{1} \leq 80\right\} .
$$

For each $\alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, 120-\alpha_{1}\right) \in H$ the transportation problem $(P C P(\alpha))$ has the optimal solution

$$
Y^{*}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rr}
\alpha_{1}-30 & 30 \\
120-\alpha_{1} & 0
\end{array}\right)
$$

Then, if $\alpha_{1} \in H_{1}=\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, 120-\alpha_{1}\right) \mid \alpha_{1} \in[50,70]\right\}$ we get

$$
X^{1}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rr}
70-\alpha_{1} & 10 \\
\alpha_{1}-50 & 0
\end{array}\right)
$$

and if $\alpha_{1} \in H_{2}=\left\{\left(\alpha_{1}, 120-\alpha_{1}\right) \mid \alpha_{1} \in[70,80]\right\}$, we get

$$
X^{2}(\alpha)=\left(\begin{array}{rr}
0 & 80-\alpha_{1} \\
20 & \alpha_{1}-70
\end{array}\right) .
$$

Then

$$
\min \left\{F\left(X^{1}(\alpha), Y^{*}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha_{1} \in[50,70]\right\}=430=F\left(X^{1}(70,50), Y^{*}(70,50)\right),
$$

and
$\min \left\{F\left(X^{2}(\alpha), Y^{*}(\alpha)\right) \mid \alpha \in[70,80]\right\}=430=F\left(X^{2}(70,50), Y^{*}(70,50)\right)$.
Hence the optimal solution for the bilevel transportation problem of the cost-cost type is

$$
X^{*}=\left(\begin{array}{rr}
0 & 10 \\
20 & 0
\end{array}\right), \quad \text { and } \quad Y^{*}\left(X^{*}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{rr}
40 & 30 \\
50 & 0
\end{array}\right)
$$

## REFERENCES

[1] Y. Chen and M. Florian, The nonlinear bilevel programming problem: formulations, regularity and optimality conditions, Optimization, 32 (1995), 193-209.
[2] D. I. Duca, L. Lupşa and E. Duca, Bicriteria transportation problems, Rev. Anal. Numér. Théor. Approx., 27 (1998), 81-90. ©
[3] D. I. Duca, E. Duca and L. Lupşa, Bicriteria transportation problems, in Research on Theory of Allure, Approximation, Convexity and Optimization, Editura SRIMA, Cluj-Napoca, Romania, 1999, 52-71.
[4] L. Lup̧̧a, D. I. Duca and E. Duca, An algorithm for multicriteria transportation problems, in Analysis, Functional Equations, Approximation and Convexity, Editura Carpatica, Cluj-Napoca, Romania, 1999, 137-141.

Received March 21, 2000.


[^0]:    "Babeş-Bolyai" University, Faculty of Mathematics and Informatics, str. M. Kogălniceanu 1, 3400 Cluj-Napoca, Romania, e-mail: dduca@math.ubbcluj.ro, llupsa@math.ubbcluj.ro.

